



The Thompson TDA Model

Text Dependent Analysis – Close Reading Lessons for *The Troll Maker* by Gail Skroback Hennessey

Grade 4 Comprehension and Analysis of Different Sources of Information and Main Idea

For students to successfully respond to text dependent analysis prompts, students should engage in close reading lessons. Close reading involves the use of a collection of evidence-based comprehension strategies embedded in a teacher-guided discussion, planned around repeated readings of a text to increase student comprehension. Close reading will often lead students to discover something important that may have been overlooked the first time they read the text. Throughout a close reading, teachers can use text dependent questions to promote discussion and help students to better understand the nuances of what they are reading. They can be used to start student discussions and give students opportunities to discuss the text with each other and voice their ideas. Successful analysis requires a study of the text in which students are able to analyze over and over again. The **Pennsylvania Academic Standards for English Language Arts** require moving instruction away from generic questions, to questions that require students to analyze what they are reading. This will help to ensure that students are college and career ready.

Considerations for the Grade 4 Close Reading Lessons

The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) close reading lessons are designed to be an example pathway for teaching comprehension and analysis of the reading elements **different sources of information** and **main idea**. The Instructional Plan guides teachers through the planning and teaching of each lesson, as well as modeling the response to a grade-appropriate analysis question.



The following instructional pathway focuses on the text *The Troll Maker*. The lessons are only one possible instructional pathway, and teachers should feel free to modify it to meet the sequence of their curriculum, accommodate content previously taught, or to meet their current students' needs. Teachers may include additional modifications if needed.

The lessons make the assumption that students may have been exposed to text dependent analysis prompts, the definition of analysis, and the deconstruction of prompts prior to reading the text. The close reading lessons incorporate some of these expectations; however, teachers may include additional modifications if needed.

Text Dependent Analysis Information

Text	<u><i>The Troll Maker</i></u> By Gail Skroback Hennessey <u><i>An Interview with Troll Artist Thomas Dambo</i></u>
Complexity (Lexile and Qualitative analysis)	Lexile level: 850 (Grade 4; 770 L – 980 L) Qualitative level: Moderately complex
Reading Elements/Structure for analysis	Different sources of information and Main idea
Reading Standards	CC.1.2.4.A: Determine the main idea of a text and explain how it is supported by key details; summarize the text. CC.1.2.4.B: Refer to details and examples in text to support what the text says explicitly and make inferences. CC.1.2.4.G: Interpret various presentations of information within a text or digital source and explain how the information contributes to an understanding of text in which it appears.
Writing Standards	CC.1.4.4.B: Identify and introduce the topic clearly. CC.1.4.4.C: Develop the topic with facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples related to the topic; include illustrations and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension. CC.1.4.4.D: Group related information in paragraphs and sections, linking ideas within categories of information using words and phrases; provide a concluding statement or section; include formatting when useful to aiding comprehension. CC.1.4.4.E: Use precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to inform about or explain the topic.



CC.1.4.4.F: Demonstrate a grade appropriate command of the conventions of standard English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling.

CC.1.4.4.S: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research, applying grade-level reading standards for literature and informational texts.

Instructional Text Dependent Analysis Question

Texts, visuals, and/or videos can support a main idea. Write an essay analyzing how the different sources of information (text and video) support and extend a main idea about saving the environment. Use evidence to support your response.

Purpose and Use of the Instructional Plan

It is important to understand that at the beginning of fourth grade, students are 9 years old and are still learning to transfer oral analysis responses to written analysis responses. The purpose of this Instructional Plan is to provide an example of how to organize close reading lessons that will lead students to understand the components of text dependent analysis (*reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing*).

In this plan the teacher models for students how to identify accurate evidence (*key details*), how to make an inference about the evidence, and what it means relative to the main idea. The close reading lessons are intended to guide instruction and not to grade or score student work.

The Instructional Plan is structured with the following three questions in mind:

- What are the **planned activities** and **text dependent questions** used to engage students in the targeted learning?
- What are the **teacher actions** for each of the activities?
- What are the **student actions** for each of the activities?

Each task is numbered and contains three parts:

- Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions
- Teacher Actions
- Student Actions

It is imperative to read the entire task to understand the structure of the Learning Plan and the interaction of the three parts. Each part of the task guides the teacher throughout the planning and teaching of the lessons.



The Learning Plan

Task #1

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task the teacher will activate prior knowledge and orient students to different sources of informational text by posing the question: *How is reading a text, looking at pictures, and watching a video about a topic, the same and different?*

Teacher Actions:

- Pose the question, *How is reading a text and watching a video about a topic, the same and different?* while displaying an informational text and the beginning of an informational video that may have been previously used in the class.
- Distribute a three-column chart or Venn Diagram, have student pairs or triads compare/contrast the two sources of information.
- Elicit student responses and record these on a class organizer.
- Display a picture of a troll from the text, such as:



Ask students to describe the information they gain from looking at the picture. Have students compare this information to what they recorded from reading about a topic and viewing information about the topic on a video. Explain that different sources provide different information. As the students read, examine the pictures, and watch the video, they will want to note what they learn from each of the informational sources.

- Explain that they will be reading a text called *The Troll Maker* and watching a video about the troll artist to determine whether the video supports the written text or extends it.



Student Actions:

- In pairs or triads, students compare/contrast the information gained from two different sources.
- Students contribute to recording their thoughts on a class compare/contrast organizer.
- As a whole group, students explain information gained from examining a picture, and compare the information to reading a text and viewing a video.

Task #2

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task the teacher will introduce the text *The Troll Maker* by modeling reading and annotating the text for key details.
- Text dependent questions related to different sections of the text will be posed to ensure comprehension.

Teacher Actions:

- Distribute the text, *The Troll Maker* and read the heading information: *People often discard, or throw away, things that are no longer useful to them. In this text, an artist has an unusual idea to address the world's trash problem and the introductory information. As a class, identify the topic of the text (e.g., saving the environment).*
- Point out the bold headings that separate the three sections of the text. Read the first bold heading, *Treasure Hunting*. Ask students to predict what details they think would be in this section and record the predictions on chart paper or white board. Repeat for each of the other two sections.
- Explain that as they read each section they will annotate or write their thoughts about the important or key details.
- Model reading the first paragraph of the beginning section while thinking aloud and engaging students in annotating the text. For example:

Text	Annotations
As a kid, I wanted to build all sorts of things, from a skateboard ramp to a castle or tree house in my backyard. I had lots of energy and creativity. The problem was that a kid doesn't have the money to purchase supplies. I started to bike around the neighborhood looking for discarded wood, rope, and other items that I could use to create things.	Wow – he started collecting trash and building things even as a kid!



- Discuss how the annotations help support understanding of the key details.
- Guide students, while thinking aloud on identifying important information versus interesting information. For example, interesting information includes “*I had lots of energy and creativity.*” Explain that this is interesting information about the individual the article is about, however, important information provides specific details that help readers understand his use of trash to build different items.
- Place students in pairs or triads to closely read and annotate the second and third paragraphs of the section or continue modeling, depending on students’ needs. Circulate as students annotate ensuring the focus is on important details that support the topic, *saving the environment*.
- Pause after the first section and discuss student annotations and text dependent questions to ensure comprehension, such as:
 - In what ways do you see Thomas Dambo helping the environment?
 - How do the details in this section relate to the heading?
- Repeat for the second and third sections.
- Review the students’ predictions about the section to determine accuracy. Help students recognize that the bold headings help them to make accurate predictions and to determine important information about the topic.

Student Actions:

- As a whole group, students identify the topic of the text (*e.g., saving the environment*).
- Students make predictions about the key details in each section of the text.
- Students follow along as the teacher reads and annotates the first paragraph or section of the text.
- In pairs, or triads, students read and annotate the remainder of the text.
- Students respond to comprehension questions.
- Students review their predictions.

Task #3

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task the teacher will support students in understanding “main idea” of the entire text using the key details.

Teacher Actions:

- Display the phrase *main idea* and ask students to turn and talk to define or explain the meaning of main idea. Define main idea as the most important thought or statement about the topic.
- Explain that they will use the details from each of the sections to determine the main idea of the text.



Note: If students have engaged in determining the author’s message/theme from narrative texts, this instruction can be used to help them understand identifying a main idea statement about the entire informational text.

- Have students reread the first section of the text and ask students identify the key details from the section. Record these in the left-hand column of a two-column chart.
- Ask students to identify one statement that summarizes the first section. Remind them that the heading can help to create the statement, such as *Trash for one person can be another person’s treasure*. Repeat the process for the second and third sections narrowing down the key idea for each section to one agreed upon statement.
- Using the three statements from the entire text, explain that they will create a one main idea statement about the topic, saving the environment.
- In triads or groups of four, have students brainstorm a possible main idea about the entire informational text by posing the question: *What is the author trying to tell the reader about saving the environment?* Have students record their statement on a sentence strip or on chart paper.
- Display the main idea statements and ask students to read each statement. Discuss the similarities and differences of each statement, as well as whether the statement is specific to one section or captures what the entire text is about. A possible main idea is *collecting and using trash for creative projects can help save the environment*.
- Identify the main idea statements that capture what the entire text is about and discuss that there are different possible ways that the main idea can be stated.

Student Actions:

- Students reread the sections of the text and identify key details.
- Students identify one key idea/statement for each section of the text.
- Students collaboratively identify a main idea of the entire text using the key ideas of each section while responding to the question: *What is the author trying to tell the reader about saving the environment?*
- Students review the main idea statements and determine the ones that capture what the entire text is about.

Task #4

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task the teacher will introduce a video about Thomas Dambo, as a different source of information.
- The teacher will guide students in determining whether the video supports the written text or extends it.



Teacher Actions:

- Remind students of the main idea from the text, *The Troll-Maker* (e.g., *collecting and using trash for creative projects can help save the environment*).
- Review with students the details that supported the main idea from the two-column chart.
- Explain that they will view a video in which Thomas Dambo is interviewed and explains how he uses trash for his creative projects and to save the environment. Tell students to listen for key details that support this main idea. For example,
 - His parents taught him about being a good steward and leaving the world a better place than when he entered it (0:17).
 - Creates sculptures that allow the broken materials to look broken rather than covering it up (1:38).
 - Creates sculptures to show how much trash we have (1:52).
- Discuss and record the key details that support the main idea on the two-column chart placing the key detail in the appropriate section. As needed, point out the difference between interesting facts and key details that support the main idea.
- Have students compare the information gained through the text. For example, both the text and the video identified that collecting trash for creative projects started when Thomas Dambo was young.
- Discuss information from the video that extended their understanding of the information from the text, such as his troll building projects are across multiple countries. Add this information to the appropriate section of the two-column chart.
- Engage students in a discussion about using information from different sources to help clarify and extend understanding of a main idea.

Student Actions:

- Students review the topic, main idea, and key details of the text.
- Students watch a video and listen for key details that support the main idea.
- Students engage in a whole class discussion comparing the information gained from the text and video and how using information from different sources can clarify and extend understanding of a main idea.

Task #5

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task the teacher will introduce and deconstruct the TDA prompt for the text *The Troll Maker* and the video *An Interview with Troll Artist Thomas Dambo*.



Note: See TDA Series: The Anatomy of a Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Prompt

- The teacher explains the meaning of analysis (*detailed examination of the elements or structure of text, by breaking it into its component parts to uncover relationships in order to draw a conclusion*).

Note: An analysis shows how two parts of the text are related to each other. A close reading examines the characteristics of the text looking for their meaning and relationship to one another supported with explicit evidence and inferences.

- The teacher will ensure student understanding of explicit evidence, inference, and interrelationship of key details and main idea. Understanding and demonstrating this information is a prerequisite for students to be able to analyze the text.

Teacher Actions:

- Display the TDA prompt: *Texts, visuals, and/or videos can support a main idea. Write an essay analyzing how the different sources of information (text and video) support and extend a main idea about saving the environment. Use evidence to support your response.*
- Read the TDA prompt aloud to students and ask the purpose of the three statements in the prompt. Listen to students' responses.

Note: If this is the first-time students are engaging in deconstructing a TDA prompt, additional support should be provided.

- Explain the meaning of the first statement and direct students to the two sources they used to support a main idea. Point out the key details recorded on the two-column chart noting that they have already found key details about the main idea from both the text and the video.
- Explain the meaning of the second statement, *Write an essay analyzing how the different sources of information (text and video) support and extend a main idea*. Direct students to the meaning of “analysis” and how they will use key details from both the text and the video to show how the main idea is supported and extended.
- Explain the meaning of the third statement, identifying that the evidence will be quotes from the text. Point out that the key details recorded will be used to provide the evidence.
- Display an Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer and distribute a copy to students. For example:



Main Idea:	
Evidence #1 <i>What is a key detail from the text?</i>	
Inference #1 <i>What does the key detail mean?</i>	
Interrelationship #1 <i>How does the key detail show the main idea?</i>	
Evidence #2 <i>What is a key detail from the text?</i>	
Inference #2 <i>What does the key detail mean?</i>	
Interrelationship #2 <i>How does the key detail show the main idea?</i>	

- Model recording the previously selected main idea on the organizer (e.g., *Collecting and using trash for creative projects can help save the environment.*).
- Review the two-column chart with the key details from the text. Ask students to select one key detail from the text that supports the main idea. Record the key detail in the Evidence #1 section.
- Explain the meaning of inference as, using the text evidence and their background knowledge to explain the meaning of the evidence. For example, if students identify a key detail as *Discarded wood, rope, and other items can be used to create things.* An inference might be, *This means that there is a lot of trash all around us that is available to be used.* Elicit other possible inferences from students. Record the inferences on the organizer.
- Remind students that the interrelationship is the analysis which shows how the key detail shows the main idea. Model, while thinking aloud, an interrelationship such as, *This shows that using trash to make things can also help save the environment from too much trash.*

Note: As students learn how to find evidence, make inferences, and state what it means, the teacher gradually releases them to work independently.

- As appropriate, either model while thinking aloud, or have students work collaboratively to complete a second Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship row of the organizer. If students work collaboratively, circulate as students work ensuring understanding of evidence, inference, and interrelationship.



- Display an additional section for the organizer. For example:

Evidence #3 <i>What is a key detail from the video?</i>	
Inference #3 <i>What does the key detail mean?</i>	
Interrelationship #3 <i>How does the key detail extend the main idea?</i>	

- As appropriate, either model while thinking aloud, or have students work collaboratively to complete an extension aspect of Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship row of the organizer. If students work collaboratively, circulate as students work ensuring understanding of evidence, inference, and interrelationship.

Student Actions:

- Students follow along and contribute to deconstructing the TDA prompt.
- Students follow along and contribute to completing the first section of the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer.
- Students work collaboratively with peers or the teacher to complete the second and third sections of the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer.

Task #6

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:

- In this task, the teacher will prepare students to write an essay drawing evidence from an informational text and video to support analysis applying grade-level standards. In fourth grade compositional writing should include:
 - Introduction of the main idea and concluding statement or section
 - Multiple paragraphs with one idea per paragraph or one paragraph with multiple ideas
 - Specific details and evidence from the sources of information
 - Inference about the evidence
 - Explanation of what the evidence and inference mean
 - Elaboration showing an interrelationship



- The teacher will model writing the response to the TDA prompt. Before teaching this lesson, the teacher writes a short complete response that coincides with the current group of students' learning regarding writing multi-paragraph responses. Beginning-of-year students may need only a one-paragraph example with introductory, evidence, inference, analysis, and conclusion statement. Middle or end-of-year students may need instruction using an introductory, multiple body, and conclusion paragraph.
- The teacher will collect student responses to determine strengths and needs with respect to the ability to demonstrate the underlying components of a text dependent analysis prompt (*reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing*). The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Learning Progressions will assist the teacher in determining next instructional steps.

Note: Students should understand the difference between the expectations of an essay and a short answer question.

Note: Fourth grade students often start with one paragraph and progress to multiple paragraphs by the end of the year.

Note: An analysis shows how two parts of the text are related to each other. In this case how the key details show the main idea.

Teacher Actions:

- Ask students to brainstorm what needs to be included in an essay response to the prompt by using probing questions. Record their ideas on chart paper. Probing questions may include:
 - How should you begin your essay/response?
 - What can an introductory statement include?
 - What information should be provided as evidence?
 - What information should be used to explain the evidence?
 - What information should show how the key detail and main idea are interrelated?
 - How should you end your essay?
- Model writing a short complete response including an introductory statement, and then using the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer for writing the body paragraphs related to the key details from two different sources and main idea while conducting a think-aloud. For example:
 - The teacher could pose a question to herself, such as, *I wonder how I should start the introduction to my essay? To start, I think I should identify the sources of information and what I will be analyzing.* The teacher reviews and reads the second statement in the TDA prompt specifically noting the two reading elements that students are expected to analyze, *Write an essay analyzing how the **different sources of information** (text and video) support and extend a **main idea**.* She then writes the first sentence. **In the text, *The Troll Maker*, and the video, *An Interview with Troll Artist Thomas Dambo*, key details are used to support and extend the main idea. The main idea is *Collecting and using trash for creative projects can help save the environment.***



The Thompson TDA Model

- The teacher thinks aloud, *I need to write my evidence from both sources next, but I can't just copy the statements from the organizer. I need to clarify which source I used, and both the pieces of evidence must be similar.* The teacher states and writes, **The text stated that Mr. Dambo found discarded wood, rope, and other items to create things.** The teacher points out that the statement is not a direct quote from the text but is put in her own words. Ensure that students understand that this is called “paraphrasing” and is acceptable evidence. Point out which parts of the statement are from the text – “discarded wood, rope, and other items” and “create things”. Note that the rest of the statement is her own thinking.
- The teacher thinks aloud, *I now need to include evidence from the video that is similar.* The teacher states and writes, **In the video, Mr. Dambo said that he learned that he could take anything from inside his mind and make it come to life.**
- The teacher thinks aloud, *I need to explain this a little more by using my inference. I remember that the inference is explaining the evidence using my background knowledge. I can write, This means that there is a lot of trash all around us that is available to be used.*
- The teacher thinks aloud, *That's not enough information because it does not explain why people should use trash. I need to add more to my inference.* The teacher adds on **This means that there is a lot of trash all around us that is available to be used. Using trash for creative purposes helps us not waste materials and cause more pollution.**
- The teacher thinks aloud, *So what does this mean about the main idea? I can use the words, “this shows” when I explain the analysis.* The teacher writes, **This shows that using trash to make things can also help save the environment from too much trash.**
- Ask students if this response answers the TDA prompt. Ask them to brainstorm for any missing pieces that are needed to answer the prompt.
- Remind students that they need to have a closing statement. Elicit from students a possible way to end the response. For example, **Different key details from the text and video support the main idea about saving the environment.**
- Depending on the strengths and needs of the students, as well as the time of the year, model writing, with student engagement, a second body paragraph or have students work in small groups to write a second body paragraph using the information from the organizer.
- Similarly, and depending on the strengths and needs of the students, model writing, with student engagement, a third body paragraph focused on how the key details from the video extend the main idea. If appropriate, have students work in pairs or triads to write a third body paragraph using the information from the organizer.



The Thompson TDA Model

Student Actions:

- Students brainstorm what information should be included in the essay response to the TDA prompt.
- Students follow along with the teacher modeling of a paragraph in response to the TDA prompt.
- Students contribute to the writing of a second and third body paragraph in response to the TDA prompt.